

Evaluation Report
2014-8

Ex-post Evaluation on Medical Equipment Provision to Ha Trung District General Hospital in Thanh Hoa Project, Vietnam

The Export-Import Bank of Korea
(Government Agency for EDCF)

EDCF Evaluation Team
(Evaluated by Korean Corporation Management Association)

This evaluation was entrusted to *Korean Corporation Management Association* by EDCF for the purpose of independent evaluation research.

The opinion, findings and conclusion or recommendations expressed in this report are those of the external evaluator and do not necessarily reflect the view of EDCF.

Executive Summary

1. Project Details

- Name of Project: Medical Equipment Provision to Ha Trung District General Hospital in Thanh Hoa
- Borrower: The Government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam (Ministry of Finance)
- Project Executing Agency: People's Committee of Thanh Hoa Province
- Amount of Support Request: USD 3 million
- Condition of Loan: Annual interest rate of 0.1%, repayment period of 35 years (including 10 year grace period)

2. Project Purpose

- The purpose of this project was to improve the medical equipment of Ha Trung General Hospital in order to respond to the needs of residents.

3. Project Scope

- Provision of Medical Equipment
- Training and Inspection
- Maintenance

4. Summary of Evaluation

- External Evaluator: Korean Corporation Management Association
- Duration of Evaluation: June 2014 – October 2014
- Method
 - The evaluation was conducted using the OECD/DAC criteria. Project Performance Index was also used to evaluate the effectiveness of the project.

- Literature review, stakeholder interview and survey, analysis on relevant statistical data and others were conducted.
- This project is evaluated as a **successful project (3.33)**, considering the rating of each criteria (i.e. Relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact, and sustainability).

Criteria	Weight	Rate	Weighted rate
Relevance	20%	3.5 (Relevant)	0.7
Efficiency	20%	3.67 (Efficient)	0.73
Effectiveness	20%	3.5 (Effective)	0.7
Impact	20%	3.5 (Influential)	0.7
Sustainability	20%	2.5 (Likely)	0.5
Overall rating		Successful	3.33

- **(Relevance)** The project's relevance appeared to be very high. The project was well-aligned with the health care policy of Vietnam and EDCF strategy, responding to the needs for medical equipment in the project area. Moreover, the Vietnamese government had high self-governing capacity. The Vietnamese government organized an institution to implement this project and actively engaged in the evaluation process.
- **(Efficiency)** The intended goal of the project was achieved earlier than planned thanks to efficient management. However, five more months were spent for additional supply of medical equipment to improve the completeness of the project.
- **(Effectiveness)** The project supported staff training and provided medical equipment including gastrointestinal endoscopy diagnosis and operation system and CT scanner with three year maintenance guarantees. 370 additional wards

were provided by the project, exceeding the original target of 300 wards. As a result, there were positive changes such as an increase in the number of hospital out-patients and annual operations and reduction in the number of transferred patients to other provinces. Although the satisfaction of employees and patients on hospital service was fair and the utilization rate of supplied medical equipment was relatively high, it was revealed that some of the equipment was not being in use.

- **(Impact)** The status of the Ha Trung general hospital in the Thanh Hoa province was expected to be elevated to the provincial hospital in 2015, enabling the hospital to play a more important role in offering the medical service. The perception of hospital employees on the impact of this project was positive. Various health indexes were improved as well. Furthermore, positive impact on the regional economy was created thanks to the decrease in the number of transferred patients to other regions and drop in fatalities related to diseases or accidents.
- **(Sustainability)** It appeared that most of the supplied medical equipment was well maintained and the perception by employees of the maintenance status was also positive. However, the level of satisfaction on maintenance service of the supplier during the guarantee period was low and some of the equipment was not in use due to the burden of purchasing expensive expendables. The hospital staff rated the level of governmental support for the hospital as ‘fairly satisfactory’.

5. Lessons Learned and Recommendations

□ Lessons Learned

- The purpose of this project was supplying up-to-date medical equipment to the Ha Trung general hospital which had high health care needs in the Thanh Hoa province. Although the project size was relatively small, it was evaluated to

generate outstanding effects in improving the health conditions and medical environment of the project area, thereby, contributing to the local development.

- Improvement in needs assessment will be helpful in enhancing the efficiency and effectiveness of the project.

□ **Recommendations**

○ **Conduct appropriate needs assessment and feasibility study**

- In order to prevent any changes in the originally agreed quantity and types of equipment during the period of project implementation, related authorities (i.e. Partner countries and EDCF) need to conduct more thorough needs assessment on medical equipment, staff capacity and operating environment.

○ **Develop better maintenance strategies**

- Maintenance strategies at each stage of project appraisal, contract establishment, and others of the project should be set in advance to prevent the occurrence of maintenance-related problems such as difficulty in the purchase of expendables. EDCF should assist partner countries to establish specific maintenance plans.

○ **Inspect on status of maintenance service based on suppliers' submission of progress reports**

- Instructing the suppliers to submit quarterly or semi-annual progress reports on their maintenance support to the project executing agencies after the project completion can help EDCF monitor the maintenance services of the suppliers and current status of maintenance.

○ **Establish project performance indicators relevant to the medical equipment supply project**

- Considering that EDCF currently supports a lot of medical equipment supply projects, more specific performance indicators for the health sector are needed to properly manage the project performance.