

Summary

1. Project Overview

Project Outline

- GMS Cambodia Northwest Provincial Road Improvement Project (“Project”) is to extend and pave the Samraong section located 29km from Sisophon on National Road 56, which passes through Cambodian northwestern farmland (i.e. Banteay Meanchey and Otar Meanchey) and connects to the Cambodia-Thailand borderland.

Project Objectives

- To promote trade relations between Cambodia and Thailand and across the GMS region by connecting the two countries;
- To improve the employment, health and education environment in Cambodia’s northwestern rural areas by improving transportation infrastructure; and
- To develop the tourism industry by improving the accessibility to historical and tourist sites.

Borrower/Executing Agency

- Borrower: Cambodian Ministry of Economy and Finance (MEF)
- Project Executing Agency: Cambodian Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MPWT)

Borrower Information

- As a co-financing project, the Project is executed with the EDCF fund of USD 29,942,000 for the remaining sections of National Road 56B, except for the section of 29km from Sisophon, which is supported by ADB.

2. Evaluation Overview

Evaluation Objectives

- This ex-post evaluation assesses the performance of the Project objectively and technically and provides strategic lessons or recommendations, so that it can contribute to conducting international development cooperation projects in a more effective manner.

Evaluation Standards

- Under the Guidelines for EDCF Ex-post Evaluation Report, this evaluation was carried out in accordance with OECD/DAC Evaluation Criteria--relevance, efficiency, effectiveness and sustainability. It does not reflect “influence” as the operating period after completion of the Project is too short to verify influence.

Evaluation Methodology

- Detailed evaluation criteria related to the performance of the Project are properly specified in accordance with its characteristics and both quantitative and qualitative assessments are conducted to achieve empirical evaluation.

3. Evaluation Results

Comprehensive Evaluation Results

- The overall score is 3.6. The Project is evaluated to be “successful.”

<Evaluation Results>

Criteria	Weight	Score	Rate
Relevance	25%	3.7	Highly Relevant
Efficiency	25%	3.1	Effective
Effectiveness	25%	3.8	Highly Effective
Sustainability	25%	3.7	Highly Sustainable
Overall	100%	3.6	Successful

Evaluation by Criteria

<Summary of Evaluation by Criteria>

Criteria	Overview
Relevance	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Project is highly relevant to the partner country (Cambodia) and EDCF supporting policies. - The Project was designed and executed in consideration of the distinctiveness of the targeted road section. Also, the relevant budget or the procedures for selecting the constructor were appropriate.
Efficiency	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The Project was delayed for 17 months compared to the original schedule (42 months) due to inevitable reasons such as bad weather condition (rainy season) and additional requests from the Cambodian government. - The Project was carried out efficiently within the planned budget.
Effectiveness	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Travel time to major destinations is reduced by more than 50% after road improvement. - Drivers' average travel distance is increased by more than 150% after road improvement. - The Project has properly achieved its original goals and the satisfaction of the stakeholders is high.
Sustainability	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - A certain level of maintenance budget is allocated annually, and the maintenance department is operated by a government system. - The Cambodian government is very supportive and cooperative in ensuring construction quality and maintenance. - Using the DBST method, a long-term plan for improvement is required due to the country's climatic characteristic, i.e. long rainy season.
Cross-cutting Issues	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Some environmental issues were resolved, and construction work was carefully conducted in order to minimize the negative effects on the environment. - The Project was properly implemented to provide beneficial working conditions to women and the disadvantaged during construction work. - Statistical figures show the number of fatal accidents has continuously decreased after completion of the Project.

4. Lessons Learned and Recommendations

Success Factors

- The partner country is very supportive in implementing the Project.
- The Project is consistent with the partner country's mid- to long-term policies.
- The Project ensures its excellent construction quality through strict supervision of the client and the supervisor.

Limitations

- More systematic monitoring and data collection are required for the relevant section.
- The principles for the scope of the Project and changes thereof should be established at the beginning of the Project.
- From the start of the Project, construction work should be discreetly planned in consideration of local circumstances, such as seasonal weather conditions and land compensation.

Recommendations

- It is necessary to maintain close ties with local residents to proceed with the Project in an amicable manner.
- Job creation by hiring local residents, as well as the effects of technical support, should be reflected in evaluation.
- The plan to collect data, including socioeconomic indicators of the relevant region, needs to be established from the start of Project.
- Considering that the possibility of fatal accidents has increased due to faster travel speed, safety measures, such as road width extension, traffic light installation, and additional installation of speed limit signs, should be included in the project plan.